SWIDLER BERLIN SHEREFF FRIEDMOCKETLEIDE COPY ORIGINAL

3000 K STREET, NW, SUITE 300 WASHINGTON, DC 20007-5116 TELEPHONE (202) 424-7500 FACSIMILE (202) 424-7645 WWW.SWIDLAW.COM

MORTON J. POSNER DIRECT DIAL (202) 424-7657 MJPOSNER@SWIDLAW.COM

919 THIRD AVENUE NEW YORK, NY 10022-9998

NEW YORK OFFICE

ORIGINAL^{12) 758-9500} FAX (212) 758-9526

RECEIVED

July 26, 1999

BY COURIER

Magalie R. Salas, Esq. Secretary Federal Communications Commission 445 Twelfth Street, S.W. 12th Street Lobby, TW-A325 Washington, DC 20554

> Re: **CC Docket No. 98-141**

Dear Ms. Salas:

On behalf of CTC Communications Corp., enclosed for filing is an original and eight copies of its Reply Comments in the above-referenced docket.

Also enclosed is an extra copy of these Comments. Please date stamp the copy and return it via my courier.

If you have any questions, please contact me.

Morton J. Posner

Counsel for CTC Communications Corp.

cc(w/encl.): Janice Myles

ITS

Jordan Michael, Esq.

cc(w/o encl.): Eric J. Branfman, Esq.

290698.1

No. of Copies rec'd 018 LIST A B C D E

BEFORE THE DOCKET FILE COPY ORIGINAL FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION

In the Matter of)	FEDERAL COMMUNICATIONS COMMISSION
Applications for Consent to the Transfer of Control of Licenses and Section 214)	OF THE SECRETARY
Authorizations from)	CC Docket No. 98-141
Ameritech Corporation, Transferor, to))	
SBC Communications, Inc., Transferee)	

REPLY COMMENTS OF CTC COMMUNICATIONS CORP.

CTC Communications Corp. ("CTC"), by counsel, hereby files its Reply Comments on the conditions proposed by SBC Communications, Inc. ("SBC") and Ameritech Corporation ("Ameritech") for their pending application to transfer control ("merger conditions"). Before SBC is permitted to complete its *next* merger, the Commission should compel SBC to honor promises it made in connection with its *previous* Southern New England Telephone ("SNET") merger, and those promises should be extended and implemented throughout SBC's proposed *new* Ameritech service area on the same schedule. SBC's eligibility to hold its *current* Commission authorizations, as well as those of Ameritech that it *proposes* to control, is dependent upon adherence to *prior* merger conditions and the market-opening provisions of the Act. SBC has failed the Commission's public interest test relative to both its previous merger with SNET and proposed merger with Ameritech.

I. MERGER CONDITIONS AND MARKET OPENING MEASURES SHOULD BE IMPLEMENTED SIMULTANEOUSLY THROUGHOUT SBC'S SERVICE TERRITORY, INCLUDING CONNECTICUT

As CTC discussed in its opening Comments, the merger conditions must be strengthened in two important ways to protect the public interest. First, they must be augmented to require SBC to abide by final administrative decisions based on the Act throughout its region, including Connecticut. Second, they must require SBC to implement the conditions in Connecticut at the same time as in other states. CTC Comments at 6-8. Implementation of market opening measures in connection with an SBC merger is not a new concept for Connecticut. As part of the SBC/SNET merger, SBC assured the FCC that it would apply market opening measures in Connecticut. In addition, the FCC noted allegations of SBC anti-competitive conduct in Texas and said that it expected that SBC conduct would not be repeated elsewhere. Unfortunately, SBC has indeed exported anti-competitive conduct to other states, particularly Connecticut, and has failed to implement promised market opening measures in that state. SBC's policies in Connecticut implicate the Commission's standard on fraudulent representations to a governmental unit as well as antitrust violations insulating local markets from competition. Given SBC's record, its future compliance with the proposed merger conditions is worrisome unless they are significantly strengthened.

See In the Matter of Applications for Consent to the Transfer of Control of Licenses and Section 214 Authorizations from Southern New England Telephone Corporation, Transferor, to SBC Communications, Inc., Transferee, CC Docket No. 98-25, Memorandum Opinion and Order, FCC 98-276, 13 FCC Rcd 21292, at ¶¶ 32, 44, 51 (1998) ("SBC/SNET Order").

 $^{^{2&#}x27;}$ *Id.* at ¶¶ 26-27.

Although SBC was ordered by the Texas Public Utilities Commission to cease imposing termination penalties on customers seeking to convert their existing service arrangement to a reseller, SBC affiliates continue to impose such termination penalties on its customers in Connecticut and other states in its service territory. As discussed in CTC's Comments, state commissions have unanimously ruled against these "switching" penalties in the resale context including most recently the Rhode Island Commission. CTC Comments at 6. Nonetheless, SBC continues to force CTC and other resellers to expend limited resources litigating this issue over and over again before state commissions. CTC Comments at 4-6. This SBC conduct is directly contrary to opening Connecticut and other markets to local competition.

Not surprisingly, SBC has demonstrated a pattern of exporting anti-competitive conduct to other states. After SBC acquired Pacific Telesis ("PacTel") in April 1997, the California Public Utilities Commission ("CPUC") cited several examples of anti-competitive conduct by PacTel.^{3/} The Texas Public Utility Commission previously cited SBC for similar infractions.^{4/} In

See, e.g., California Public Utilities Commission Telecommunications Division, Initial Staff Report, Pacific Bell (U 1001C) and Pacific Bell Communications Notice of Intent To File Section 271 Application for InterLATA Authority in California, at 26 (July 10, 1998) (misuse of customer proprietary network information ("CPNI") to maintain or win back customers that had chosen to switch carriers); id. at 37 (deficiencies in Pacific Bell's provision (or more accurately, failure to provision) collocation space to its competitors); id. at 29-30 (failure to provide competitors with adequate access to Pacific Bell's Operations Support Systems); id. at 41 (refusal to comply with its obligations under Section 252(I) of the Act).

See, e.g., Investigation of Southwestern Bell Telephone Company's Entry Into the Texas InterLATA Telecommunications Market, Project No. 16251, Commission Recommendation, at 3 (ordering SWBT not to use CPNI to win back customers lost to competitors); id. at 9 (directing SWBT to establish performance measures for the number of days required to complete physical collocation facilities); id. at 13 (ordering SWBT to either improve the preordering interfaces available to CLECs or show that CLECs have access to customer records at parity with the access SWBT enjoys); id. at 2 (directing SWBT to "establish that its interconnection agreements

addition, following SBC's acquisition of PacTel, numerous complaints were filed relating to its business practices and customer service policies. Increased consumer complaints were noted by the CPUC, ⁵ California consumer groups, ⁶ and PacTel's own employees. ⁷

In short, in spite of its assurances to this Commission to the contrary and in spite of repeated state commission directives to implement market opening measures, SBC failed to institute such measures throughout its service area. If, as SBC's President of Special Markets Stephen M. Carter has stated, "there is no reason to expect [SBC's record in opening its networks] will be any different with Ameritech," the Commission should not approve the merger as proposed at all. See Affidavit of Mr. Stephen M. Carter in Support of SBC-Ameritech Merger at 15.

SBC's continued failure to implement market opening measures throughout its service territory - and in particular its obstinacy relative to unwarranted switching penalties - demonstrates that SBC lacks the "citizenship, character, financial, technical and other qualifications" required for the commission's approval of the proposed merger. Such a showing are binding and are available on a nondiscriminatory basis to all CLECs.").

See, e.g., Order Instituting Rulemaking on the Commission's Own Motion into the Service Quality Standards For All Telecommunications Carriers and Revisions to General Order 133-B, R.98-06-029 (Cal. PUC, June 18, 1998) (noting that customer complaints about deteriorating telephone service proliferated following the SBC-PacTel merger).

See, e.g., The Utility Consumers's Action Network v. Pacific Bell (U-1001-C), C. 98-04-004 (Cal. PUC, filed June 2, 1998) (citing Pacific Bell's allegedly deceptive and misleading marketing campaigns for Caller ID and related services).

See, e.g., Telecommunications International Union, International Federation of Professional and Technical Engineers, AFL-CIO v. Pacific Bell and SBC, Docket No. C. 98-06-049, filed June 18, 1998 with the California Public Utilities Commission (alleging that SBC had implemented a sales policy emphasizing sales over service and customer satisfaction).

is an integral part of the Commission's public interest analysis under Section 310(d) to approve the transfer of control. See SBC/SNET Order at ¶ 26. Specifically, SBC's record demonstrates violations of "laws protecting competition." See id. at ¶¶ 26-27. In order to ensure that SBC complies with its most recent set of proposed merger conditions, the Commission should adopt CTC's suggestion that SBC abide by final administrative decisions based on the Act throughout its region. CTC Comments at 7. Otherwise, SBC will continue to violate the market opening provisions of the Act until CTC and other competitors bring wasteful and duplicative enforcement actions throughout its region. CTC respectfully requests that the Commission assert its jurisdiction and bring an end to these anticompetitive switching penalties once and for all.

II. SBC AND ITS AFFILIATES SHOULD BE REQUIRED TO ALLOW LOCAL TELECOMMUNICATIONS RESALE WITHOUT ASSESSING TERMINATION PENALTIES

As noted in the Comments of Ntegrity Teleconnect Services, Inc. ("Ntegrity"), "market opening conditions in a region should facilitate rapid competitive entry, eliminate any unreasonable start-up costs that the applicants could impose on new competitors and minimize the applicants' ability to increase competitors' direct and indirect long-term operating costs."

See Ntegrity Comments at 7-8 (quoting Thomas Krattenmaker of the FCC's Office of Plans and Policy). SBC's imposition of unreasonable and illegal switching penalties create a severe restraint on competition. In particular, the proposed merger conditions must include a requirement that SBC and its corporate affiliates cease imposing termination penalties on customers seeking to avail themselves of the services of resellers.

In spite of numerous orders to the contrary, SBC and other ILECs continue to unlawfully impose termination penalties on customers merely seeking to convert their existing contract

service arrangements to resellers. As discussed in CTC's Comments, all commissions considering the matter ruled that imposing termination penalties on resold services constitutes an unreasonable or discriminatory condition or limitation on the resale of such telecommunications service in violation of the Telecommunications Act. In order to ensure that SBC and its affiliates do not import such recalcitrant practices to the Ameritech regions, as SBC has permitted in its SNET region, the Commission should include a provision in the merger conditions requiring that SBC and its affiliates permit customers to avail themselves of the services of resellers without incurring unwarranted switching penalties. Such a measure will "facilitate rapid competitive entry" by reducing unreasonable start-up and long-term operating costs associated with entry into local telecommunications marketplaces dominated by SBC and its corporate affiliates.

III. CONCLUSION

Despite a poor record of complying with the market opening provisions of the Act, SBC proposes to further delay local competition in Connecticut and beyond to the Ameritech regions. The Commission should modify the proposed merger conditions to include the prohibition of termination penalties when local service is switched to a reseller. Without such protections, SBC will once again misrepresent its conduct, as it has as much as promised, but failed in a market-opening experiment in Connecticut. SBC/SNET Order at ¶ 32. There are significant allegations that should lead the Commission "to be concerned that the proposed merger would inhibit or delay the development of competition in market" currently served by Ameritech. SBC/SNET Order at ¶ 31. Clearly, it is time for SBC to honor its promises to this Commission, and to honor state commission orders without need for duplicative enforcement actions in all of SBC's states.

Respectfully submitted,

Eric J. Branfman

Morton J. Posner

SWIDLER BERLIN SHEREFF FRIEDMAN, LLP

3000 K Street, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20007

Tel. (202) 424-7500

Fax (202) 424-7645

Counsel for CTC Communications Corp.

Dated: July 26, 1999

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Morton J. Posner, hereby certify that on this 26th day of July 1999, copies of the foregoing Reply Comments of CTC Communications Corp. in CC Docket No. 98-141 were sent via first class U.S. mail to the parties on the attached list.

Morton I Posner

Kerry Bruce City of Toledo Department of Public Utilities 420 Madison Avenue - Suite 100 Toledo, Ohio 43604-1219 Michigan Attorney General Frank J. Kelley, Attorney General Orjiakor N. Isogu, Asst. Attorney General 525 West Ottawa Street Lansing, Michigan 48909

Texas Office of the Public Utility Counsel Rick Guzman, Asst. Public Utility Counsel P.O. Box 12397 Austin, Texas 78711-2397 Ellis Jacobs, Esq.
Dayton Legal Aid Society
333 West 1st Street - Suite 500
Dayton, Ohio 45402

Antoinette Cook Bush Skadden Arps Slate Meagher & Flom, LLP 1440 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005-2111 Anna Montana, Mayor Village of Schiller Park 9526 West Irving Park Road Schiller Park, IL 60176

Anthony C. Epstein Jenner & Block 601 Thirteenth Street, N.W. - 12th Floor Washington, D.C. 20005 Mary Carol Kelley, Director Worldwide Communications Compaq Computer Corporation 20555 Tomball Parkway Houston, Texas 77070

Allen Parker, Village Manager Village of Maywood 115 South Fifth Avenue Maywood, IL 60153 Guy T. Gray VP Telecommunications Cendant Corporation 6 Sylvan Way Parsippany, N.J. 07054 William P. Barr, Executive Vice-President Government and Regulatory Advocacy and General Counsel GTE Corporation One Stamford Forum Stamford, Connecticut 06904

Michael Kellogg Kellogg, Huber, Hansen, Todd & Evans 1301 K Street, N.W. - Suite 1000 West Washington, D.C. 20005

Nina Holland AMOCO 501 Westlake Park Blv. P.O. Box 3092 Houston, Texas 77253-3092

John Vitale Bear, Stearns & Co., Inc. 245 Park Avenue New York, New York 10167

Dr. Mark Cooper Consumer Federation of America 1424 16th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036 Mavis Pizella, Manager Network Services Levi Strauss & Co. Levis Plaza P.O. Box 7215 San Francisco, CA 94120

Robert N. Tatum, Director Network Services Edward Jones 201 Progress Parkway Maryland Heights, MO 63043-3042

G. Nichols Simonds
Vice President & Chief Information Officer
Emmerson Electric Co.
8000 West Florissant Avenue
St. Louis, MO 63136

Consumer Union and The Consumer Federation of America Gene Kimmelan Consumers Union 1666 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20009

E. Spire Communications, Inc. Brad E. Mutchelknaus Andrea Pruitt Kelley, Drye & Warren, LLPL 1200 19th Street, N.W. - Suite 500 Washington, D.C. 20036 Triton PCS, Inc.
Leonard J. Kennedy
David E. Mills
Laura H. Philips
Dow, Lohnes & Albertson, PLLC
1200 New Hampshire Avenue, N.W. - Suite 800
Washington, D.C. 20036-6802

United Cellular Corp.
Alan Y. Naftalin
Peter M. Connolly
Loteen & Naftalin, LLP
1150 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. - Suite 1000
Washington, D.C. 20036

Michael E. Glover Bell Atlantic Network Services, Inc. 1320 North Court House Road - 8th Floor Arlington, Virginia 22201 Dr. Marta Sotomayor, President National Hispanic Council on Aging 2713 Ontario Road, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20009

Sol Del Ande Eaton, President Latin American Women and Supporters 4501 Havelock Road Lanham, Maryland 20706 Warner H. Session, President Telecommunications Advocacy Project 1150 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. - Suite 900⁻ Washington, D.C. 20036

Jeffrey A. Eisenach, Ph.D.
President
The Progress & Freedom Foundation
1301 K Street, N.W. Suite 550E
Washington, D.C. 20005

Charles B. Molster III Winston & Strawn 1400 L Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005-3502

Carmen L. Nieves, President
Federal of Hispanic Organizations of the Baltimore
Metropolitan Area, Inc.
15 Charles Street - Suite 1701
Baltimore, Maryland 21201

Terry L. Etter
Assistant Consumer's Counsel
Ohio Consumer's Counsel
77 South High Street - 15th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43266-0550

International Transcript Service 1231 20th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20554

Johanna Mikes
Common Carrier Bureau
Federal Communications Commission
The Portals
445 Twelfth Street, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20554

Tom Krattenmaker
Office of Plans & Policy
Federal Communications Commission
The Portals
445 Twelfth Street, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20554

James R. Young
Executive Vice-President - General Counsel
Bell Atlantic Corporation
1095 Avenue of the Americas
New York, New York 10036

Indiana Office of Utility Consumer Counselor John Cook, Assistant Consumer Counselor 100 North Senate Avenue, Room N501 Indianapolis, Indiana 46204-2208 Elizabeth Nightingale Common Carrier Bureau Federal Communications Commission The Portals 445 Twelfth Street, S.W. Washington, D.C. 20554

Bill Rogerson
Office of Plans & Policy
Federal Communications Commission
The Portals
445 Twelfth Street, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20554

Lisa Youngers MCI WorldCOM, Inc. 1801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006

Martha Hogerty Missouri Office of the Public Counsel P.O. Box 7800 Jefferson City, MO 65102

Philip W. Horton, Esq. Arnold & Porter 555 12th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20004-1206 Jeffrey Mayhook GST Telecom, Inc. 4001 Main Street Vancouver, WA 98663

EMC Corp. Martin O'Riordan 171 South Street Hookinton, MA 01748-9013

Cablevision Lightpath, Inc.
Cherie R. Kiser
William A. Davis
Mintz Leven Cohen Ferris Glovsky and Popeo, PC
701 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004-2608

CTC Communications Group William L. Fishman Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP 3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300 Washington, DC 20007-5116

Corecomm LTD
Eric Branfman
Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP
3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300
Washington, D.C. 20007-5116

Communications Workers of America Debbie Goldman George Kohn 501 Third Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20001

Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands Thomas K. Crowe Elizabeth Holowinski Law Offices of Thomas K. Crowe, P.C. 2300 M Street, N.W. - Suite 800 Washington, D.C. 20037 James L. Gattuso Competitive Enterprise Institute 1001 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. - Suite 1250 Washington, D.C. 20037

Consumer Groups
Patricia A. Stowell
Public Advocate
Division of the Public Advocate
820 N. French Street - 4th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801

Focal Communications
Russell M. Blau
Robert V. Zener
Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP
3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300
Washington, D.C. 20007-5116

Network Plus, Inc. Russell M. Blau Kathleen L. Greenan Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP 3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300 Washington, D.C. 20007-5116 Freedom Ring Communications Morton J. Posner Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP 3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300 Washington, D.C. 20007-5116

Todd McCracken National Small Business United 1156 15th Street, N.W. - Suite 1100 Washington, D.C. 20005 USDA Christopher A. McLean Deputy Admin. Rural Utilities Service Washington, D.C. 20250

PacTaec Communications, Inc. Eric Branfman Eric Einhorn Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP 3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300 Washington, D.C. 20007-5116 Competitive Telecommunications Assn. Robert J. Aamoth Melissa Smith Kelley, Drye & Warren, LLP 1200 19th Street, N.W. - Suite 500 Washington, D.C. 20036

Debra Berlyn
Executive Director
CPI - Competition Policy Institute
1156 15th Street, N.W. - Suite 520
Washington, D.C. 20005

Hyperioin Telecommunications, Inc. Richard Rindler Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP 3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300 Washington, D.C. 20007-5116

J.J. Barry
International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers
1125 15th Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006

Angela D. Ledford Keep America Connected P.O. Box 27911 Washington, D.C. 20005 KMC Telecom, Inc.
Patrick Donovan
Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP
3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300
Washington, D.C. 20007-5116

Pam Whittington
Public Utility Commission of Texas
1701 N. Congress Avenue
P.O. Box 13326
Austin, Texas 78711-3326

David N. Porter Richard S. Whitt MCI WorldCom, Inc. 112 Connecticut Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

WorldPath Internet Services
Eric Branfman
Morton J. Posner
Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP
3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300
Washington, D.C. 20007-5116

Bill Hunt Level 3 Communications, Inc. 3555 Farnam Street Omaha, NE 68131 Pilgrim Telephone, Inc. Scott Blake Harris Jonathan B. Mirsky Harris, Wiltshire & Grannis, LLP 1200 18th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

RCN Telecom Services, Inc.
Russell M. Blau
Anthony Richard Petrilla
Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP
3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300
Washington, D.C. 20007-5116

State Communications, Inc. Harry M. Malone Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP 3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300 Washington, D.C. 20007-5116

William McCarty
Indiana Utility Regulatory Commission
302 West Washington Street - Suite E306
Indianapolis, IN 46204

Lisa B. Smith
R. Dale Dixon, Jr.
MCI WorldCom, Inc.
1801 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20006

Linda F. Golodner National Consumers League 1701 K Street, N.W. - Suite 1200 Washington, D.C. 20006 Mark E. Buechele Supra Telecom & Information Systems 2620 S.W. 27th Avenue Miami, Florida 33133

Telecommunications Resellers Assn. Charles C. Hunter Catherine M. Hannan Hunter Communications Law Group 1620 I Street, N.W. - Suite 701 Washington, D.C. 20006

Irvin W. Maloney Occidental Petroleum Corp. 1640 Stonehedge Road Palm Springs, CA 92264

AT&T C. Frederick Beckner, III Sidley & Austin 1722 I Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20006 TRICOM USA, Inc.
Judith D. O'Neill
Nancy J. Eskenazi
Thelen Reid & Priest, LLP
701 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. - Suite 800
Washington, D.C. 20004

US Xchange, LLC Dana Frix Swidler Berlin Shereff Friedman, LLP 3000 K Street, N.W. - Suite 300 Washington, D.C. 20007-5116 Steven G. Bradbury Kirkland and Ellis 655 15th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005

Carmen Nieves, Director Child Health Foundation 10630 Little Patuxent Parkway - Suite 126 Columbia, Maryland 21044 Walter Fields
New Jersey Coalition for Local Telephone Competition
P.O. Box 8127
Trenton, N.J. 08650

Gerlad F. Masoudi Kirkland & Ellis 655 Fifteenth Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005

Paul K. Mancini General Attorney and Assistant General Counsel SBC Communications, Inc. 175 East Houston Street - Suite 1306 San Antonio, Texas 78205 James Ellis V.P. & General Counsel SBC Communications, Inc. 175 East Houston Street - Suite 1306 San Antonio, Texas 78205

Richard Hetke Senior Counsel Ameritech Corporation 30 South Wacker Drive - 39th Floor Chicago, Illinois 60606